

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW MEXICO

STATE OF NEW MEXICO, *ex rel.*
State Engineer

Plaintiff,

vs.

ROMAN ARAGON, *et al.*,

Defendants.

69cv07941-MV/LFG

RIO CHAMA STREAM SYSTEM
Section 7, Village of Chama

M-B Ditch

**MOTION BY THE STATE OF NEW MEXICO
TO REVISE SUBFILE ORDERS
ASSOCIATED WITH THE M-B DITCH**

The plaintiff State of New Mexico, *ex rel.* State Engineer (“State”) moves the Court to revise all subfile orders entered in the Village of Chama subsection describing irrigation water rights under the M-B Ditch, and in support states the following:

1. OSE License 1974 granted to the water users under the M-B Ditch a license to appropriate surface water for irrigation purposes by direct diversion from both the Rio Chama and the Rio Chamita. The principal authorized diversion of the M-B Ditch uses the same point of diversion on the Rio Chama as the previously existing Chama Town Ditch. Water diverted from the Rio Chama is transported in the enlarged Chama Town Ditch to the Rio Chamita and to a second point of diversion from the Rio Chamita serving the M-B Ditch. Both the waters of the Rio Chama and the Rio Chamita are recognized as sources of water for irrigation purposes under OSE License 1974.

2. The hydrographic survey of the Village of Chama recognized the Rio Chama and the Rio Chamita as dual sources of water for irrigation use under the M-B Ditch, but failed to list or

describe the point of diversion on the Rio Chama. This error was incorporated into various subfile orders in these proceedings. *See, e.g.* Consent Order filed June 18, 2004 (Doc. 7485) (listing X and Y coordinates for point of diversion on Rio Chamita but not Rio Chama). An attempt to clarify this matter on subfile orders entered in 2007 and afterward has caused confusion, and could be interpreted to imply that there is more than a single M-B Ditch. *See, e.g.* Consent Order entered June 13, 2008 (Doc. 9213) (describing “M-B Ditch–Rio Chama” and “M-B Ditch–Rio Chamita” as sources of water and points of diversion),

3. In order to avoid possible confusion on the nature of the M-B Ditch, and the multiple points of diversion and sources of water for tracts of land irrigated by that ditch, all of the subfile orders entered in the Village of Chama subsection describing irrigation water rights under the M-B Ditch should be revised to list the source of water for tracts irrigated by the M-B Ditch and the points of diversion for the M-B Ditch, as follows:

Source of Water: Surface water of the Rio Chama and the Rio Chamita, a tributary of the Rio Chama.

Point of Diversion:

Ditch: M-B DITCH

Diversion 1: Rio Chama

Location X = 1,546,909 feet **Y** = 2,155,273 feet

Diversion 2: Rio Chamita

Location X = 1,540,798 feet **Y** = 2,149,300 feet

New Mexico Plane Coordinate System, Central Zone, NAD 1983

4. The revisions described in paragraph 3 above will also correct minor errors in the description of the Y coordinate in the point of diversion of the M-B Ditch from the Rio Chamita in

certain subfiles. *See, e.g.*, Consent Order entered June 13, 2008 (Doc. 9213) (Y coordinate incorrectly described as Y = 2,149,302).

5. Individual subfile orders describing water rights under the M-B Ditch that should be amended and revised are as follows:

CHCV-003-0001, Consent Order filed June 18, 2004 (Doc. 7485) (Porter Family Trust);

CHCV-003-0002A, Consent Order filed May 18, 2005 (Doc. 7895) (Boyd Family Revocable Trust);

CHCV-003-0002B, Consent Order filed July 29, 2004 (Doc. 7531) (Dustin Boyd);

CHCV-003-0003, Consent Order filed September 3, 2004 (Doc. 7577) (Renee Martinez);

CHCV-003-0004, Consent Order filed June 30, 2004 (Doc. 7505) (Yvonne Torrez);

CHCV-003-0005B, Consent Order filed December 10, 2007 (Doc. 9052) (Dr. Pat Hale);

CHCV-003-0006, Consent Order filed December 12, 2003 (Doc. 7342) (Johnny Rael);

CHCV-003-0007, Consent Order filed February 23, 2004 (Doc. 7411) (Jeff M. Daggett, Maxine F. Daggett);

CHCV-003-0008, Consent Order filed December 12, 2003 (Doc. 7341) (Pedro & Rose Torrez Trust);

CHCV-003-0009, Consent Order filed February 23, 2004 (Doc. 7410) (Los Campos de Chama, LLC);

CHCV-003-0010, Consent Order filed October 23, 2003 (Doc. 7305) (Vigil Family Trust);

CHCV-003-0011, Consent Order filed July 24, 2006 (Doc. 8339) (Lydia J. Garcia, Napoleon R. Garcia);

CHCV-003-0012, Order Granting Default Judgment filed March 6, 2007 (Doc. 8596) (Betty M. Martin);

CHCV-003-0013, Consent Order filed September 3, 2004 (Doc. 7576) (Charles C. Hobbs);

CHCV-003-0014, Consent Order filed March 24, 2006 (Doc. 8209) (Celine M. Brown, Orrin

G. Brown);

CHCV-003-0015, Consent Order filed December 12, 2003 (Doc. 7340) (Angie Valdez, Don Valdez);

CHCV-003-0016, Order Granting Default Judgment filed July 14, 2005 (Doc. 7948) (Julia A. Meston, Russell D. Meston);

CHCV-003-0017, Consent Order filed April 4, 2007 (Doc. 8612) (Matthew M. Gallegos, Robert Gallegos, Jr., Maria A. Martinez);

CHCV-003-0018, Consent Order filed July 29, 2004 (Doc. 7532) (Marvin R. Crane, Sandra A. Crane);

CHCV-003-0019A, Consent Order filed July 24, 2006 (Doc. 8340) (Carmen Gonzales, Florian Gonzales Jr.);

CHCV-003-0019B, Consent Order filed May 15, 2008 (Doc. 9197) (Carmen Gonzales, Florian Gonzales Jr.);

CHCV-003-0020, Consent Order filed June 30, 2004 (Doc. 7506) (June J. Overley Living Trust);

CHCV-003-0021, Consent Order filed March 24, 2006 (Doc. 8210) (Robert R. Kissam, Susan L. Windeck);

CHCV-003-0022, Order Granting Default Judgment filed March 5, 2009 (Doc. 9422) (Herman Candelaria, Puanani Kauaihilo, Michael J. Roundy);

CHCV-003-0023, Consent Order filed July 24, 2006 (Doc. 8341) (James W. McElhaney, Maxine McElhaney);

CHCV-003-0024, Consent Order filed August 12, 2005 (Doc. 7999) (Andrew Conder Jr., Cheryl Conder, Kenneth Conder, Peter J. Conder, Russell Fink);

CHCV-003-0025, Consent Order filed July 29, 2004 (Doc. 7527) (Elizabeth Ann Harris, Floyd Harris);

CHCV-003-0026, Consent Order filed March 6, 2007 (Doc. 8585) (Estate of Carlotta Valdez, Estate of Maximilo Valdez);

CHCV-003-0027A, Consent Order filed May 4, 2006 (Doc. 8276) (Michael Montaño, Peggy Montaño, Steve Montaño, Steven Montaño);

CHCV-003-0027B, Consent Order filed May 6, 2006 (Doc. 9187) (Michael Montaño, Peggy Montaño, Steve Montaño, Steven Montaño);

CHCV-003-0028, Order Granting Default Judgment filed March 6, 2007 (Doc. 8597) (Victoria L. Skrondahl);

CHCV-003-0029A, Consent Order filed December 12, 2003 (Doc. 7339) (Dan Russom, Mary Russom);

CHCV-003-0029B, Order Granting Default Judgment filed November 1, 2007 (Doc. 8981) (Andrew Hurd, Daniel Hurd);

CHCV-003-0030, Consent Order filed December 12, 2003 (Doc. 7338) (Randy Pettingill);

CHCV-003-0031, Consent Order filed June 18, 2004 (Doc. 7484) (Rosalie Ann Gonzalez)

CHCV-003-0032, Consent Order filed February 24, 2004 (Doc. 7408) (Estate of Juan Gonzales);

CHCV-003-0033, Consent Order filed February 23, 2004 (Doc. 7407) (Estate of Juan Gonzales);

CHCV-003-0034, Consent Order filed August 24, 2007 (Doc. 8767) (Estate of E.T. Reilly Sr.);

CHCV-003-0035, Consent Order filed November 18, 2004 (Doc. 7649) (Jose G. Salazar, Mary Salazar);

CHCV-003-0040, Consent Order filed May 4, 2006 (Doc. 8277) (Juanita Gonzales);

CHCV-003-0041, Consent Order filed September 3, 2008 (Doc. 9271) (Herman Candelaria);

CHCV-003-0042, Consent Order filed September 3, 2008 (Doc. 9269) (Herman Candelaria);

CHCV-003-0043, Order Granting Default Judgment filed March 5, 2009 (Doc. 9422) (Herman Candelaria, Puanani Kauaihilo, Michael J. Roundy);

CHCV-004-0001, Consent Order filed May 18, 2005 (Doc. 7896) (Melvin E. Kurth Jr.);

CHCV-004-0002, Consent Order filed December 12, 2003 (Doc. 7337) (Los Campos de Chama, LLC);

CHCV-004-0003, Consent Order filed December 12, 2005 (Doc. 8085) (Melvin E. Kurth Jr.);

CHCV-004-0004B, Consent Order filed June 13, 2008 (Doc. 9213) (James A. Heath, now Chama Troutstalkers, LLC, *see* Order for substitution filed April 25, 2012 (Doc. 10812)).

WHEREFORE, the State requests the Court to enter its Order to revise all subfile orders entered in the Village of Chama subsection describing irrigation water rights under the M-B ditch as described in paragraphs 3 and 5 above. A proposed form of Order that grants this Motion is attached hereto as Exhibit 1.

Pursuant to the Court's February 4, 2013 *Order* (Doc. 10891), the State requests the Clerk of the Court to mail copies of the approved Order requested in this Motion to the *pro se* parties listed below at the address listed.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Ed Newville
EDWARD G. NEWVILLE
Special Assistant Attorney General
Office of State Engineer
P.O. Box 25102
Santa Fe, NM 87504-5102
(505) 867-7444

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on the 2nd day of May, 2013, I filed the foregoing electronically through the CM/ECF system which caused the parties on the electronic service list, as more fully set forth in the Notice of Electronic Filing, to be served by electronic mail, and served the following non-CM-ECF participants in the manner indicated:

via first class mail, postage prepaid addressed as follows:

CHCV-003-0001
Porter Family Trust
Robert & Thomas P. Porter TTEE
P.O. Box 394
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0002A

Boyd Family Revocable Trust
Richard R. Boyd and Vera M. Boyd, Trustees
P.O. Box 346
Blanco, NM 87412

CHCV-003-0002B

Dustin Boyd
P.O. Box 242
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0003

Renee Martinez
4932 Rio Cebolla Ct. NW
Albuquerque, NM 87114

CHCV-003-0004

Yvonne Torrez
140 Boyd Way
Carmel, CA 93923

CHCV-003-0005B

Dr. Pat Hale
7100 Menual NE
Albuquerque, NM 87110

CHCV-003-0006

Johnny Rael
P.O. Box 453
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0007

Jeff M. Daggett
Maxine F. Daggett
P.O. Box 497
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0008

Pedro & Rose Torrez Trust
Pedro and Rose Torrez
#3 Road 5803
Farmington, NM 87401

CHCV-003-0009

Los Campos de Chama, LLC
C. Mott Wooley, Esq.
P.O. Box 430
Santa Fe, NM 87504

CHCV-003-0010

Vigil Family Trust
Joe C. and Loyola G. Vigil
P.O. Box 395
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0011

Lydia J. Garcia
Napoleon R. Garcia
P.O. Box 652
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0012

Betty M. Martin
P.O. Box 654
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0013

Charles C. Hobbs
P.O. Box 2277
Milan, NM 87021

CHCV-003-0014

Celine M. Brown
Orrin G. Brown
13476 Hwy 349 N.
Live Oak, FL 32060

CHCV-003-0015

Angie Valdez
Don Valdez
P.O. Box 733
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0016

Julia A. Meston
Russell D. Meston
P.O. Box 700
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0017

Matthew M. Gallegos
Robert Gallegos, Jr.
Maria A. Martinez
P.O. Box 323
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0018

Marvin R. Crane
Sandra A. Crane
HC 75, Box 48
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0019A

Carmen Gonzales
Florian Gonzales Jr.
P.O. Box 344
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0019B

Carmen Gonzales
Florian Gonzales Jr.
P.O. Box 344
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0020

June J. Overley Living Trust
E. B. Overley Sr. et al.
18 Antebellum
Odessa, TX 79762

CHCV-003-0021

Robert R. Kissam
Susan L. Windeck
P.O. Box 672
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0022

Herman Candelaria
P.O. Box 39
Chama, NM 87520

Puanani Kauaihilo
Michael J. Roundy
10404 Las Palmas St., NW
Albuquerque, NM 87114

CHCV-003-0023

James W. McElhaney
Maxine McElhaney
P.O. Box 367
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0024

Andrew Conder Jr.
1119 Belmont Ave.
Pueblo, CO 81004

Cheryl Conder
110 E. Indiana Ave.
Walsenburg, CO 81089

Kenneth Conder
6844 E. Harvard Ave.
Denver, CO 80224

Peter J. Conder
2908 Rice
Pueblo, CO 81005

Russell Fink
6432 Utica St.
Arvada, CO 80003

CHCV-003-0025

Elizabeth Ann Harris
Floyd Harris
P.O. Box 600
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0026

Estate of Carlotta Valdez
Estate of Maximilo Valdez
Gylen Aguilar
P.O. Box 922
Peñasco, NM 87553

CHCV-003-0027A

Michael Montaño
Peggy Montaño
Steve Montaño
Steven Montaño
P.O. Box 124
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0027B

Michael Montaño
Peggy Montaño
Steve Montaño
Steven Montaño
P.O. Box 124
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0028

Victoria L. Skrondahl
8401 Spain Rd. NE, Apt. 50D
Albuquerque, NM 87111

CHCV-003-0029A

Dan Russom
Mary Russom
P.O. Box 103
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0029B

Andrew Hurd
P.O. Box 745
Chama, NM 87520

Daniel Hurd
3400 Lake Mary Rd., Apt. 20202
Flagstaff, AZ 86001-9235

CHCV-003-0030
Randy Pettingill
P.O. Box 885
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0031
Rosalie Ann Gonzalez
P.O. Box 1062
Española, NM 87532

CHCV-003-0032
Estate of Juan Gonzales
Sam Gonzales
2400 W. Main
Farmington, NM 87401

CHCV-003-0033
Estate of Juan Gonzales
Sam Gonzales
2400 W. Main
Farmington, NM 87401

CHCV-003-0034
Estate of E.T. Reilly Sr.
Edwin Reilly Jr.
2631 Concon St.
San Antonio, TX 75251

CHCV-003-0035
Jose G. Salazar
Mary Salazar
P.O. Box 593
Española, NM 87532

CHCV-003-0040
Juanita Gonzales
P.O. Box 11
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0041
Herman Candelaria
P.O. Box 39
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0042
Herman Candelaria
P.O. Box 39
Chama, NM 87520

CHCV-003-0043
Herman Candelaria
P.O. Box 39
Chama, NM 87520

Puanani Kauaihilo
Michael J. Roundy
10404 Las Palmas St., NW
Albuquerque, NM 87114

CHCV-004-0001
Melvin E. Kurth Jr.
235 Camino del Norte
Santa Fe, NM 87501

CHCV-004-0002
Los Campos de Chama, LLC
C. Mott Woolley
P.O. Box 430
Santa Fe, NM 87504

CHCV-004-0003
Melvin E. Kurth Jr.
235 Camino de Norte
Santa Fe, NM 87501

/s/ Ed Newville
EDWARD G. NEWVILLE